DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 229 416 TM 830 315

AUTHOR Golub, Lester S.
TITLE Using Process Evaluation Data for Determining Exemplary Bilingual Education Programs.
PUB DATE Apr 83
NOTE 50p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (67th, Montreal, Quebec, April 11-15, 1983).
PUB TYPE Speeches/Conference Papers (150) -- Reports - Evaluative/Feasibility (142)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Access to Education; *Bilingual Education Programs; English (Second Language); Equal Education; Evaluation Criteria; Evaluation Methods; *Formative Evaluation; Language Proficiency; *Program Evaluation; *Program Improvement; *Questionnaires
IDENTIFIERS Assessment Instruments; *Process Analysis

ABSTRACT

Areas of process evaluation which are crucial but often overlooked in determining exemplary bilingual education programs are presented. The process evaluation components discussed are: (1) needs assessment; (2) program planning; (3) commitment and competencies of staff; (4) nature and appropriateness of instruction and curriculum; (5) pupil selection and retention; (6) classroom behavior and satisfaction of pupils; (7) exit rate of pupils to regular school program; (8) institutionalization of the program; (9) organization and management of the program; and (10) community satisfaction and support of the program. These components are included in the accompanying 41-page Process Questionnaire for Assessing Exemplary Bilingual Education Programs. (PN)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED229416

Using Process Evaluation Data for Determining Exemplary Bilingual Education Programs

Lester S. Golub
The Pennsylvania State University

The intent of bilingual education programs in the United States is to assure that equal access to education be provided to children and school-age students who speak a language other than English. The motivation behind equal access to education is to inhibit large portions of the population from falling into the ranks of the impoverished, illiterate, and unemployed. Bilingual education programs, like other human services programs, all too often have been misguided, misconceived, badly implemented, and ineffective. In order to improve and maintain exemplary programs, that is, programs of high quality, program staff, administrators, and policy makers must determine answers to questions such as:

1. Is the bilingual education program reaching the appropriate target?
2. Is it being implemented in the way specified?
3. Is the bilingual education program effective?
4. How much does it cost per student in the program compared to the cost for pupils not in the program?
5. Is it worth spending the extra money, given its effectiveness?

The first three questions, appropriate target population, implementation, and effectiveness, are basically process concerns. How well children achieve on a given standardized test is a product concern. This paper discusses the areas of process evaluation which are crucial but often overlooked in determining exemplary, bilingual education programs.

TM 830 315

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

L.S. Golub

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Process Evaluation Contrasted to Product Evaluation

In general, process evaluation refers to evaluation activities related to target identification, needs assessment of the target group, and project implementation, planning and impact other than pupil achievement as measured on a standardized test. Process evaluation components provide a validation for a bilingual education program in ways other than the pupil achievement component.

Product evaluation refers to the measureable outcome as stated in the goals of the program. In bilingual education, the major goal is to provide participating pupils with enough English language skills so that they have equal access to the local school curriculum. This English language proficiency can be measured with a norm-reference test and achievement scores compared in the following ways:

1. Scores on a measure for target pupils participating in the bilingual education program minus their scores on an alternate form of the measure after intervention, that is, comparison of pretest-posttest measures.

2. Scores on a measure for target pupils after participating in the bilingual education program minus scores on the same measures and at the same time of a presumably equivalent control group, that is, treatment group compared to control group.

3. Difference of scores of the target pupils who participate in the bilingual education program and near target pupils or pupils who have recently left the program.

In general, process evaluation measures cannot be compared to some other measures, they are more descriptive than comparative and for that reason are frequently not given the weight by policy makers as are the

product evaluation data. Product evaluation must also weigh the worth of the product to the cost, that is, the product must be a good buy, it must be cost effective.

The Components of a Process Evaluation

The criteria for assessing exemplary bilingual education programs must include both product and process evaluation components. The major process components which have to be assessed in determining an exemplary bilingual education program include: 1) needs assessment, 2) program planning, 3) commitment and competence of staff, 4) nature and appropriateness of instruction and curriculum, 5) pupil selection and retention, 6) classroom behavior of pupils, 7) exit rate of pupils to regular school program, 8) institutionalization of the program, 9) organization and management of the program, and 10) community satisfaction and support of the program. These process evaluation criteria will be described briefly.

Needs Assessment. A careful needs assessment in three distinct areas is essential for the successful development of an exemplary bilingual education program: 1) the education and human needs for education of the participating immigrant population, 2) the future employment needs in the community and the future educational needs for gaining employable skills for the target population, and 3) the resources and support within the school district community.

A prerequisite for applying for funds for a bilingual education program is based on need as demonstrated by a demographic needs assessment of the minority language group to be served, include: 1) the number of the target population in the immediate service area, and 2) the average educational level participant dropouts, rates of unemployment, average

income, and welfare status of members of the minority language group. Figures should be recent, immediate, and accurate. National or state figures are useless. The figures should be comparative showing the difference between education level, employment, and average income of the target group and the general population or other minority groups in the area. The most reliable sources of this information include: 1) the local employment office, 2) the Bureau of the Census, 3) the Department of Health and Human Services, and 4) community public service agencies.

Future employment needs of the target population may be determined by administering a job survey questionnaire to potential employers of the target population. Labor market statistics available from the Department of Labor are helpful in determining future employment possibilities for the target population. Many employment opportunities require university and postsecondary education. The education needs of minority language pupils who will go on to technical and postsecondary education should also be assessed.

Finally, a quality needs assessment should consider the resources of the school district and the community for implementing a successful bilingual education program. Funding must be available for additional materials, teachers, aides, equipment, and above all, the non-immigrant community must show some interest in retaining and incorporating the immigrant community into its life blood.

Program Planning. Much of the success of a bilingual education program depends upon the care and thoroughness of the planning behind the program. Many of the problems which are likely to affect a program can be avoided through careful, pre-program implementation planning.

Planning for a bilingual education program must be accomplished in a systematic and organized way. In the preimplementation planning, these factors should be considered: 1) reliable needs assessment data; 2) clearly stated, measureable program objectives; 3) the methods and instruments for measuring success; 4) adequate time, facilities, and equipment; 5) sufficient financial support; 6) appropriately trained, bilingual staff; and 7) appropriate curriculum and materials.

A well coordinated bilingual education program needs extensive planning in the following program components: 1) needs assessment; 2) advisory committee; 3) establishing linkage with business, labor, community, and institutes of higher education; 4) administrative structure; 5) program design; 6) scheduling; 7) staff recruitment and job descriptions of staff; 8) staff development; 9) curriculum development and coordination; 10) evaluation; and 11) implementation.

Commitment and competencies of staff. Attitudinal and professional skills of the staff are important indicators of exemplary bilingual education programs. Bilingual proficiency, knowledge of subject matter and the ability to teach it in two languages, ability to teach English as a second language, and cultural sensitivity are absolute necessities for the staff. Since the staff is ultimately responsible for the success of the program, careful staff recruitment and in-service training is absolutely vital to the success of a bilingual education program. Job descriptions for each staff member should be clear and specific. Each staff member should also have a specially developed interest or vocation which can be shared with pupils in two languages.

Also some counseling skills are necessary for all staff members. Provisions for staff development and staff interpersonal communication should be provided. There are many resources for staff development which include: 1) use of consultants, 2) speakers from community agencies, 3) bilingual education teachers from other exemplary programs, 4) professional organizations, and 5) institutions of higher education.

Nature and appropriateness of instruction and curriculum. While the nature and appropriateness of instruction and curriculum seem obvious, they are usually the last criteria to be addressed. This area is of particular importance in bilingual education programs since it is often difficult to assess a pupil's previous experience in subject matter or how it was taught in a previous school or country. Also, there is the problem of cultural determinants of learning style. That coupled with the distribution and frequency of time of instruction in one language or the other, the ESL component and its use in subject matter teaching as well as adequate cross-cultural training make bilingual education a special curriculum and an instruction challenge.

Pupil selection and retention. Pupil selection, retention, and promotion are key factors in determining an exemplary bilingual education program. Most bilingual education programs do not select all of the non-native speakers of English for the program. Only those who fall below a certain criterion level on a standardized test in English language proficiency should go into the program. The program should be paced so that pupils stay and develop their English language skills, not more than three years, and when an exit criterion level is reached, gradually released or promoted from the program. Documentation of continuous individual pupil progress should be available to the staff.

Classroom behavior and satisfaction of pupils. The social, psychological, physical, and intellectual behavior of a pupil will help determine how well

placed the pupil is in the bilingual education environment. Observations of individual pupils will indicate pupil behavior and indicate the pupil's prognosis for success within the bilingual education program.

Exit rate of pupils to regular school program. Two factors have made bilingual education programs suspect. One factor is the retention of pupils in a bilingual education program long after they have reached criterion level in English language proficiency, the other is the exit of pupils from the program before achieving criterion level. At least one third of the pupils should exit the bilingual education program each year and normal pupils should not remain in the program more than three years. Non-native English speaking pupils with special needs should be given special attention which goes beyond retention in a bilingual education program for more than three years.

Institutionalization. The result of an excellent bilingual education program and an excellent bilingual education evaluation, both product and process, should lead to the institutionalization of that exemplary program after federal funds have been removed and as long as the need lasts. The question of institutionalization must be considered from the beginning of the planning of the program. A bilingual education program which vanishes with the federal funding cannot be exemplary, since institutionalization was not considered essential by the policy makers. Not all of the program need be institutionalized to make it exemplary. The scope of the program may decrease, staff may be eliminated, state or federal funds may be reduced, but in general, parts of the program, its methodology, process, and curriculum will remain and be integrated into the regular program of the local education agency.

Organization and management of the program. The success of any bilingual education program depends on its administrative structure, its organization and management. A management plan is the first step in achieving an efficient

administrative structure. The management plan must detail the responsibilities of each staff member; program milestones and a time line must be part of the management plan. Exemplary organization and management of bilingual education programs include: 1) specific lines of authority; 2) clear job descriptions; 3) lines of authority and job descriptions explained to staff; 4) director aware of limits of authority, 5) staff aware of goals of the program; 6) collaboration of staff members; 7) program director with administrative experience; 8) communication between program director, staff, administration, target pupils and community; 9) program with open door policy; 10) staff initiated new ideas, 11) regular meeting of director and staff; 12) documentation of all program activities; 13) use of media for information and dissemination; 14) director supervised implementation of the curriculum and program components; and 15) easy access of program site.

Community satisfaction and support of the program. All of the tax payers of a local school district financially support the programs of a school district be they bilingual education, sports, or vocational education. The tax payers, the business and industry, and the minority language groups must have positive perceptions of the program and be supportive of the program. Without these positive perceptions and support from the constituencies of the community, the bilingual education program is doomed for failure rather than becoming exemplary.

The accompanying PROCESS QUESTIONNAIRE FOR ASSESSING EXEMPLARY BILINGUAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS can be used for conducting the process evaluation.

PROCESS QUESTIONNAIRE FOR ASSESSING EXEMPLARY

BILINGUAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS

Assessing the Quality of the Needs Assessment

Occupational Needs and Opportunities of the Target Group

Have you contacted the chief of research and analysis in your State Employment Security Agency? Yes ___ No ___

Do you have any data that shows current employment trends for the target population as well as estimated future needs? Yes ___ No ___

What is the future occupational outlook for the target group in your state?

Are any changes foreseen in state and area economic activities for the target group?

What are the characteristics of the work force in your community? Will it accommodate works from the target group?

How did you determine future occupational and educational needs of the target group?

How many persons from the target group are unemployed in the community?

Did you contact the State Employment Security Agency to obtain detailed labor market data on employment statistics of the target group?

How did you gather your data?

What is the general level of education and training of persons from the target group in the community?

Elementary Education:	completed __	not completed __
Secondary Education:	completed __	not completed __
Higher Education:	completed __	not completed __
Vocational Training:	completed __	not completed __ (Specify)
Special Training	completed __	not completed __ (Specify)

What is the employment structure of important industries in your community?

Are they willing to employ workers from the target group?

Staff Recruitment Needs

How did you recruit staff?

What was the greatest problem in finding suitable staff?

If any staff changes were made during the school year, what were the principal considerations in doing so?

What are the three most important staff qualifications to the success of the program? (Indicate for each position: Director, Bilingual Education teacher, English as a second language worker)

Is the instructional and support staff capable of using both languages for instruction? Yes ___ No ___

Is there bilingual capacity among:

___Bilingual Education
___Project Manager
___ESL Teacher
___Administrators
___Counselors
___Bicultural Studies teacher
___Other (Specify)

Staff Development Needs

Does the program provide in-service training for the staff?
Yes ___ No ___

Who was involved in planning staff development?

What needs assessment was carried out to serve as a basis for staff development activities?

What kinds of in-service training has the staff received (pre-program and during program)?

Can you cite any specific efforts to gather information about the group to be served which became part of staff development?

How many hours of in-service training have the staff received per month? (list by each individual staff member)

What topics were covered?

___ Bilingual Education Methodology
___Career ed
___State requirements
___Counseling
___Management
___ESL
___Rules/regulations
___Testing/assessment
___Other(s)
___Cross-cultural issues
___Occupational Opportunities

Of the in-service training offered, how many hours were offered/arranged by each of the following:

	Number of hours
USOE	
BE program	
Sponsoring institution	
BE teacher education project	
A professional organization: (name:)	
State Department of Education	
Consulting firm	
Other: (Specify)	

Name resource persons who presented most successful in-service programs.

Describe the effectiveness of the in-service/staff development program. Cite specific areas of success/failure.

Give any concrete examples of changes made in the program as a result of staff development (from one year to another; from one cycle/semester to another; from before to after a meeting).

How often do you hold staff meetings?

weekly ___ biweekly ___ monthly ___ other ___

When? during program hours ___ after program hours ___

Is attendance required? Yes ___ No ___

After staff members paid to attend these meetings? Yes ___ No___

What is usually done during staff meetings?

What have been the most important considerations/problems in scheduling and arranging for in-service/staff development?

What is the best way to deal with these issues?

The Advisory Committee Needs

Is there an advisory committee to the program? Yes ___ No ___

If so, how representative is it of the total community?

How was it chosen (what criteria were used)?

Practically specified, how important has the advisory committee been to the success of the program? Explain.

What have been the most important considerations in the successful utilization of the committee?

What have been the major obstacles to the effective operation of the advisory committee?

What is the role of the advisory committee?

What is the importance of having an advisory committee for this program?

What has been your involvement in: curriculum design, program operations, contacting local business/industries, recruitment of staff, staff development?

How was the chairperson, if any, chosen (elected by the committee, appointed by the program director, appointed by community organization, other)?

How is general membership on the advisory committee attained?

Election ___ Appointment ___

Volunteer ___ Other (explain) ___

How many members are on your advisory committee?

0-5 ___ 6-10 ___ 11-15 ___

16-20 ___ More than 20 ___

What is the term of membership on your advisory committee?

1 year term ___ 2 year term ___ 3 year term or more ___

What percentage of your advisory committee are women?

___None ___Half

___Less than one-fourth ___More than half

___Between one-fourth and half ___All

Did you have an orientation session to explain roles and functions of the committee? Yes ___ No ___

Is there a formal plan or statement by the organization/program recognizing the advisory committee? Yes ___ No ___ (Explain)

Has the organization/institution/program specified the scope of responsibility of the advisory committee? Yes ___ No ___

If your Bilingual Education program is federally funded, was the advisory committee formed prior to the preparation of the proposal submitted to the Department of Education?

How does the advisory committee function?

___Formal with written rules

___Formal with unwritten rules

___Informal with understood rules

___Informal with no rules

Where does the advisory committee meet?

___In the school

___In community center

___In homes

___Rotating

How often does the advisory committee meet?

___Weekly ___Monthly

___Twice a month ___Other (Please explain)

When are meetings held?

___During the day ___Weekend

___Evening ___Other (Specify)

___Combination of both

Does the advisory committee keep minutes of each meeting?
Yes ___ No ___

How are decisions made by the advisory committee?

___Unanimous consent ___Simple majority

___Maximum majority ___Other (Explain)

Does the advisory committee issue notices to the public?
Yes ___ No___

If yes, how? ___Television ___Radio
___School publications ___Newspaper

Program Planning, Implementation, and Evaluation

Indicate the degree of planning, implementation, and evaluation which went into the bilingual education program in the following scale:

1 = none or hardly any

2 = some but probably not enough

3 = abundant

Program Planning

___Textbook selection

___Course selection or content

___Budget planning

___Development of objectives

___Identification of needs

___Planning of school facilities

___Cost effectiveness

___Other

Program Implementation

___Identify community resources and public relations

___Interpretation of program to community

___Curriculum support

___Personnel policies

___In-service training and teacher development

___Other

Program Evaluation

___Evaluation of trainees

___Evaluation of teachers

___Evaluation of program

___Evaluation of administrators

___Evaluation of objectives for curriculum

___Evaluation of community perceptions

Commitment and Competence of Staff

Classroom Instruction

Does the instructor give evidence that he/she knows the subject/topic being taught? Yes ___ No ___

What evidence supports this?

How does the instructor give evidence that he/she is adapting instruction to the needs of the students?

___Organization of the basic course

___Type of presentation

___Use of multiple materials, media, presentational strategies

___Use of tutors, aides, translators, community resources, ect.

What does the instructor do that is different from what is done with English speakers?

What competencies are necessary in order to do so?

Is the instructor an effective communicator with students being served?

What evidence supports this?

Are students responding appropriately to the instruction?

___Involved in learning

___Achieving success

___Free of negative behaviors: frustrations, puzzled or not comprehending, tuned out, hostile, apathetic, etc.

Is the objective for the class clear? (whether stated or not?)
Yes ___ No ___ (Explain)

Does the instructor use classroom management strategies appropriate to bilingual education?

Does the bilingual education teacher make appropriate use of the student's language (native or second) in instruction?

When did the bilingual education teacher use the student's native language?

___To explain concept

___To deliver, introduce and explain school procedures and policies

___To introduce books and materials used in the bilingual education program

___To introduce classroom procedures

___To perform counseling functions

___To identify study skills

When did the bilingual education teacher use English?

___To reinforce language learned in the ESL component

___To teach vocabulary in context

___To explain classroom procedures

___To explain concepts consistent with English proficency

___To practice responding to directions in English

___To practice study skills

___To practice interpersonal skills

- ___teacher to pupils
- ___pupil to pupil
- ___pupil to aide or other adults

What evidence is there that each staff member is resourceful in:

___Keeping abreast of current trends in the bilingual education?

___Developing new instructional strategies?

___Adapting own behavior for a new situation?

___Finding ways of expressing empathy and concern students?

Assessing Subject Area Instruction

Are you using any materials from a foreign country?
Yes ___ No___

If so, what have you done to adapt them?

Are non-verbal media used to support instructional materials?
Yes ___ No ___ (Explain)

If all staff members are not bilingual, how is instruction offered in two languages?

___Team teaching

___Use of aide always present

___Use of aide present at scheduled times

___Use of tutors (as opposed to qualified aides)

___Use of peer tutoring/small group cooperation

___Use of translations

___Other (s) (Specify)

Are staff members aware of not only the content but also the teaching strategies employed by their colleagues? Yes ___ No ___

Is project management staff actively involved in planning?
Yes ___ No ___

How did both the subject area and ESL teachers go about identifying and sequencing the language?

To what extent have materials had to be developed for the bilingual education program?

What sorts of materials are they?

How useful/effective have they been?

Have essential literacy skills needed for the subject area been identified?
Yes ___ No ___

If yes, what are the identified skills? (Explain)

Have they been incorporated into the curriculum? Yes ___ No ___

Are they actually being taught? Yes ___ No____

If yes, what is the evidence?

How much previous experience has the subject area teacher had in teaching bilingual education and teaching a simular population?

Which of the following approaches are known and practiced by bilingual teachers in the subject area class?

	Known		Practiced	
	Yes	No	Yes	No
Audio-lingual				
Functional notional				
Cognitive code				
Silent way				
Counseling learning				
Communicative				
Community learning				

What methods are most effective, under what circumstances? (Give details)

What are some real examples of how the bilingual approach to teaching subject matter has been more effective than the traditional monolingual approach?

ESL Instruction

What kind of instructional materials are used by the ESL teachers?

Is the ESL teacher using non-verbal media to support instructional materials?
Yes ___ No ___

Is the same instructional material used in both the subject areas and ESL components?
Yes ___ No ___

If no, what kinds of materials are shared?

___Textbooks

___Lesson plans

___Materials locally developed

___Materials from other countries

___Other

Does the ESL teacher meet with the subject matter teacher to plan?
Yes ___ No ___

If yes, how often?

Are both teachers aware of the content and teaching strategies used by each other? Yes ___ No ___

What are the best ways of teaching subject matter related English?

Does the identified subject area language usage comprise the basis of the ESL component? Yes ___ No ___

If no, why not?

What sorts of materials have been developed for the ESL class?

What kinds of training does the ESL teacher have in teaching ESL?

Which of the following approaches are known and practiced by the ESL teachers?

	Known		Practiced	
	Yes	No	Yes	No
Audio-lingual				
Functional notional				
Cognitive code				
Silent way				
Counseling learning				
Communicative				
Community learning				

To what extent have regional variations for vocabulary items been identified in English and the pupils' native language?

What use has been made of these in the curriculum/instructional program?

Are students given the opportunity to learn in ESL instruction all regional/social variants which would be useful?

How does the ESL teacher deal with questions of standard vs. nonstandard usage, and with regional differences in English?

Does the instructional materials used in the ESL class reflect an awareness of the students' culture? Yes ___ No ___ (Explain)

Does it reflect an awareness of regional/social differences in English?

Does the ESL teacher speak the students' language?

If no, how do they communicate with them?

Can you give examples of how counseling informantion has affected instruction in ESL?

What has the ESL teacher learned from the bilingual education subject matter teacher?

Name the three most important strategies in teaching ESL to LEP students receiving bilingual education?

Nature and Appropriateness of Curriculum and Instruction

Do instructional strategies being used appear to be appropriate to the content area being taught? Yes ___ No ___

How do you determine this?

Do materials being used appear to be appropriate to the group?
Yes ___ No ___

What problems have been encountered with the materials or their use?

Is the language too complicated? Yes ___ No ___

Is there overuse or overreliance on textbooks? Yes ___ No ___

Are you using materials from another country or another bilingual education program?

What problems or successes have you found with their use?

Are you developing or adapting any materials? Yes ___ No ___

Why has this been necessary?

What more needs to be done?

What have you done to promote cooperation and integration among program components?

What successes have you encountered?

Do any program components function independently of others?
Yes ___ No ___

If yes, which ones?

What specific activities are required/encouraged to promote the coordination or integration of program components?

___ staff members meet regularly for planning

___staff members attend each other's classess

___staff jointly discuss problems of individual pupils

___regular reporting required from each component using a common form or set of questions

___ other (s)

Do the subject area, language, and counseling components share a common set of objectives? Yes ___ No ___

Are the objectives competency-based? Yes ___ No ___

To what extent is this necessary or useful?

What are the most important traditional or religious events or the cultural group served by the program?

How were these observed in the program?

How does this relate to the effectiveness of the program?

What specific majority cultural patterns included in the bilingual education program and who is responsible (solely or primarily) for teaching them (counselor, bilingual education teacher, ESL teacher, subject matter teacher, total staff)?

Does the instructional material being used reflect appropriate use of the student's two languages?

Cultural language (posters)	Yes ___	No ___
Processes--task analysis directions,	Yes ___	No ___
Identification of books, materials, media	Yes ___	No ___
Key points in concepts	Yes ___	No ___
Standards of conduct for the school site	Yes ___	No ___

Does the currriculum reflect wise choices in selection of materials in each language? Yes____ No____

Has the program avoided development or use of inappropriate or poor quality instructional materials, such as:

Overuse of a textbook Yes____ No____

Translations of whole books or worksheets Yes____ No____

Translations of materials not being used Yes____ No____

What audiovisual materials are used to support instruction?

Which of these audiovisual materials are available on the market?

Which ones were developed by the program?

Are the same instructional materials used by both the subject areas and ESL components? Yes____ No____

What kinds of instructional materials have been translated by the program?

Who is responsible for translations?

How is need for translation determined?

By whom?

Has the bilingual education program identified the specific language of the subject area being taught, e.g., content specific language, list of technical terms, processess to be followed and explanations of concepts and strategies?
Yes ___ No ___

Has the identified language been incorporated in the curriculum?
Yes ___ No ___

How was the ESL curriculum developed?

Have essential literacy skills needed for the subject area been identified?

How realistic are the identified skills?

Have they been incorporated into the curriculum? Yes ___ No ___

Does the instructional program reflect the parallel sequencing of subject area skills and language skills?

What is the time sequence?

Does the parallel sequencing reflect:

day by day?	Yes ___	No ___
week by week?	Yes ___	No ___
unit by unit?	Yes ___	No ___

If parallel structure is not used, which component is taught first, subject area area or ESL?

To what extent do the ESL materials used in the bilingual education program utilize the identified subject area language?

To what extent were they developed locally for the project?

Culture

What has been done in the curriculum to adapt the program to the pupils' culture? (Beliefs--scientific vs. traditional accounts of group origins, cultural phenomena, coping procedures)

Are cultural patterns to be learned clearly identified in the curriculum?

What assurance is there in the curriculum or activities that cultural variation will be presented as differences rather than deficiencies?

Are they presented in contrast to the traditional culture of the pupil or as unrelated information?

Does the instructional material used reflect an awareness of dialect differences?

How are dialect features provided for in the curriculum?

To what extent have dialect variations for vocabulary items been identified?

Please describe the curriculum in your own words.

Counseling

What specific problems were involved in finding prospective employers for pupils?

How receptive were they to hiring limited English speakers?

What reservations did they express?

What referral services are available for target pupils?

To what extent was the bilingual education program adapted for the needs of a specific employer? (Explain)

During the bilingual education program, approximately how many hours went into training for each of the following job placement skills:

	0-5 Hours	5-10 Hours	10-15 Hours	15-20 Hours	20+ Hours
Absenteeism					
Promptness					
Cooperation					
Attitude					
Appearance					
Courtesy					
Work standards					
Negotiating salary					
Salary issues					
Job interviews					
Work habits					
Filling-out applications/ employment forms					
Securing necessary credentials/fringe benefits/workmen's compensation insurance					

What salary range are the graduates from the bilingual education program receiving?

How many graduates received public assistance?

What counseling was considered necessary for the target group in your program?

How do you provide counseling to the pupils?

Give examples of how counseling information has affected instruction in subject areas or ESL classes.

How do you help pupils select post-secondary education, vocational schools and colleges or universities?

How do you communicate counseling experiences of pupils with parents?

How do you counsel pupils in matters of health and personal hygiene?

Cultural Responsiveness of the Program

How distant are the pupils culturally from the native English speaking pupils in the school?

What is the target group's national origin?

What percentage of target group have been in the U.S. for:

___less than a year
___1-2 years
___2-4 years
___4-6 years
___6-10 years
___more than 10 years

Are there any cultural norms for which a pupil would be reprimanded in the classroom?

Any for which he/she would get unpleasant or hostile reactions from the teacher or peers?

Any for which he/she would be subject to ridicule?

Areas to consider:

____greeting and leavetakings

____manners

____diet and eating

____nonverbal learning style

____voice level

____questioning

____dress

____attitude towards teaching/learning

____expressions of gratitude, appreciation, sympathy, concern, laughter responsiveness

____interpersonal language

____proxemics

____friendship patterns

____silence or noise

____male/female interactions

____handling time (pacing)

____interaction

Study habits

____promptness

____absenteeism

____cooperation

____receiving and giving criticism

____receiving and giving directions

When cultural differences cause a problem, what do you do?

Who is responsible for teaching the pupils patterns which are different from his/her culture?

____counselor

____bilingual education teacher

____ESL teacher

____vocational teacher

____total staff

____other (specify)

How is information transmitted about student problems, what is to be taught, student achievement, and promotion or exit readiness from one staff member to another?

Is there a formal system for such information?

Who is involved in the system?

What were principal barriers to success in the program last year? (Explain)

What were successful means of dealing with them?

What are the principal barriers this year?

How are you dealing with them?

What are the logistics of keeping a central record for each student?

Does the student record contain information gathered during screening and recruitment? Yes ___ No ___

What adaptations have been made in the bilingual education program as a result of addressing individual student needs?

___time ___finances

___learning patterns ___attitude toward instruction

Pupil Selection and Retention

Were the bilingual education program requirements realistically presented to students and parents so that they could make choices? Yes ___ No ___

How were the requirements and criteria for bilingual education program explained to students at the time of placement, including the course of study, time commitment of the program, absenteeism, and the quality of work expected?

Were contracts or student agreements used? Yes ___ No ___

What kind of information was collected on pupils?

Were any prospective EP students screened out? Yes ___ No ___

If yes, for what reasons?

Was the advisory committee involved or asked to be involved in establishing entry criteria of pupils? Yes ___ No ___

Intake

What is the potential pupil's level of English proficiency?

Speaking	Listening	Reading	Writing
___Beginners	___Beginners	___Beginners	___Beginners
___Intermediate	___Intermediate	___Intermediate	___Intermediate
___Advanced	___Advanced	___Advanced	___Advanced

Based on what assessment procedures and instruments?

What procedures or instruments were used for determining personal characteristics, e.g., aptitude, interest, background of pupils? (Specify)

How were these instruments or procedures used? (Explain)

Did you adapt any test or develop a new one? Yes ___ No ___

If yes, how were they adapted?

Classroom Behavior and Satisfaction of Pupils

Current Target Pupils

Are target pupils adjusting to the classroom environment?

Are target pupils communicating with other ethnic group and monolingual English pupils?

Are target pupils appropriately placed in the academic program?

Are target pupils adjusting to school procedures and policies?

Are parents satisfied with target pupils' placement and program?

Are target population personal hygiene habits satisfactory?

Are individual study habits of target population satisfactory?

Are pupils appropriately placed in the vocational, athletic, art, and music programs of the school?

How has counseling helped target pupils?

How important is counseling to target pupils?

Which of the following supportive services has been provided to target pupils during the bilingual education program?

___Clothing
___Meals
___Health services
___Transportation
___Other

How convenient is the bilingual education site to the place where target pupils live?

How long does it take target pupils to get to the school site?

___Less than half hour
___Half hour
___45 minutes
___One hour
___One hour and a half
___Two hours

How do target pupils travel from home to school?

___by car
___walk
___bus
___other
___by train, trolley, subway

How has the training affected target pupils' attitude toward work and further education?

Does bilingual education program include a vocational component?
Yes ___ No ___

If yes, how long is the vocational component?

What is the content of the vocational component?

What has been the most valuable or helpful results of the vocational component?

What are the problems involved in the vocational component?

How valuable to the target pupils is the vocational components compared to the rest of the program?

Is what the target pupils are learning in ESL helping them in the subject area class? Yes ____ No ___ (Explain)

What other things do target pupils have to learn in the ESL class?

What activities or exercises in the ESL class do target pupils find most useful/least useful?

Most Useful	Least Useful

In the subject area class, are target pupils using more of your first language at the beginning and less as time went on? Yes ____ No ___

To what extent is the subject area class are target pupils' ask/encouraged to talk about the skill being learned?

Do instructors use words that the target pupils do not understand?

Yes ___ No ___ If yes, Frequently ___ Occassionally ___
Seldom ___

When target pupils know a word different from the one the teacher is using, do they offer to use it in class? Yes ___ No ___

How does the teacher react to its use?

How do teachers who do not know target pupil's language communication with them?

Would target pupils rather have a teacher who can use their language or an aide to translate for them?

Do target pupils have any trouble understanding information as it is presented by their teachers?

Does the teacher take time to repeat or explain words or expressions that target pupils do not understand?

What means of presentation or teaching strategies are most helpful to target pupils in learning?

Which of the following events related to target pupil's culture have been celebrated during the program?

___religious	___local	___political
___seasonal	___historical	___death rituals
___personal	___family	___others (specify)

To what extent are activities of classroom interrupted to notice each listed event?

___Total distruption for one or more days

___Half day interruption

___Momentary interruption

___Other

Who in the program is involved in noticing the event?

___Everybody	___No one	___Family members
___Target pupils	___Close friends of target pupils only	

Are target pupils involved in celebrations which are not part of their own culture? Yes ___ No ___

Which ones?

What is the reaction of the staff to target pupil's celebrations?
Positive ___ Negative ___

What are the most important things target pupils and parents can say about the bilingual education program and their teachers?

What do teachers do to express concern for target pupil's welfare and success?

What are some things instructors/counselors/director do which make target pupils dissatisfied?

How adequate are the educational facilities, e.g., labs, classrooms, shops, etc?

___Well equipped
___Comfortable
___Clean
___Attractive
___Well organized
___Efficient/convenient
___Orderly
___Other(s)

Can target pupils give at least three honest reasons whey they are in the bilingual education program?

What are the three most important factors contributing to target pupil's satisfaction/dissatisfaction of the program?

In general terms, how would target pupils describe the bilingual education program?

Former Target Pupils

When did target pupil exit the bilingual education program?

When did target pupils graduate from high school?

What do target pupils consider to be the most important aspect of the bilingual education program?

What jobs do former target pupils hold now?

Are they satisfied with their job? Yes ___ No ___ (Explain)

If so, what components of the bilingual education program do you consider to be the most influential preparing them for their occupation?

Are former pupils encountering any difficulty in performing their job duties?
Yes ___ No ___

Can former pupils handle postsecondary content in English? Yes ___ No ___

What components do they think should be added to the bilingual education program?

Why?

Has the target population been contacted by the program after graduation?
Yes ___ No ___

For what purposes?

How do parents and pupils learn about the bilingual education program?

Are former pupils planning on continuing their schooling? Yes ___ No ___

Why?

Which was their favorite class during the program?

Why?

Which of the following instructional strategies does the target population consider to be the most helpful (H)/important (I)/appropriate (A) to them during the program?

___individualized instruction

___small group instruction

___peer assistance

___verbal and non-verbal communication strategies

___hands-on experiences

___demonstrations

___use of audiovisual resources

___English language breakdown into small steps

___other (Specify)

Do former target pupils have any recommendations for future development of the bilingual education?

Did former target pupils have any trouble understanding the materials used during the program:

In their native language? Yes ___ No ___ If yes, Why?

In English? Yes ___ No ___ If yes, why?

How important was counseling to former target pupils? (Explain)

Do they think that they need additional English language teachers to succeed in school or on the job?

Can they cite examples of any communication problems which they encountered in the program?

Exit Rate of Pupils to the Regular School Program

What percent of pupils placed in bilingual education programs did the project place in jobs for which they completed high school compared to total school population.

What percent of pupils placed in bilingual education programs continued their education following high school compared to total school population?

Have you followed the progress of the pupils after they exit the bilingual education program?

Of the pupils who entered the program last year, what percentage are still in the program? _____

Two years ago? ___

Three years ago? ___

Longer than three years? ___

How many (%) former pupils in bilingual education programs have found jobs?

How many (%) have dropped out of school?

For what reasons have they dropped out?

What does staff consider the main reasons they are able to successfully retain target group pupils in school?

Does the bilingual education program cooperate with other states and federally-funded programs?

What kind of information was collected and kept on each target pupil?

Who is responsible for maintaining target pupil files?

How are the records of target pupil's progress kept?

How could they be improved?

Is a current ongoing record kept of an individual's achievement of objectives?
Yes ___ No ___

What kind of information was kept?

How are the records of a target pupil's progress used by the staff, teachers administrators, and counselors?

Institutionalization of the Program

Which agency provides the funding for the bilingual education program and what percentage?

___Federal, Title VIII or Title I %_____

___State %_____

___Local %_____

Has School Board agreed to continue the program when external funding is decreased or withdrawn, dependent on need?
Yes ___ No ___

What components of the program will be (are being) retained to institutionalized? _____

Which staff members will be (are being) retained in institutionalizing the program?

In institutionalizing the bilingual education program, how will it be changed?

What efforts or plans have been/are being made to institutionalize the program?

If efforts or plans have been initiated, describe the problems and successes in doing so, modifications required, ect.

Organization and Management of the Program

Where is the bilingual education program housed administratively?

To whom does the bilingual education program director report?

Does this administrative location/arrangement have any specific advantages or disadvantages?

How supportive has the administration been of the bilingual education program?

To what extent are program decisions limited or influenced by: federal constraints, administrative rules and procedures, school schedules, nature of sponsoring school district, other factors (specify, e.g., business procedures, personal choices)?

Who, outside of the bilingual education program, exerts the most influence on the program?

Give examples of any decisions made outside the program.

Who pays for the supportive services provided to the target pupils?

What effect has the bilingual education program had on its local education agency or other organizations in the area or state?

What subject areas has the school traditionally taught within the curriculum?

Does the administration have prior experience in bilingual education program?
Yes ___ No ___

What is the history of responsiveness of the local education agency to minority community concerns and needs?

How much effort for coverage does the local school district make to publicize the program?

Community Satisfaction and Support of the Program

Community Support

How well known is the bilingual education program in the community?

___Very ___Fairly ___Not at all

What evidence supports this?

What community support or pressure exits for continuance or institutionalization of the program?

What evidence supports this?

What ties do the staff of the program have to the community, especially the minority community?

What efforts have been made to engender community support for the bilingual education program?

Has the community, especially the target population, been canvassed regarding their perception of the need and importance of the program? Yes ___ No ___

How?

Has an effort been made to inform the community of plans to develop a progam and to solicit participation in the planning process? Yes ___ No ___

Are staff drawn from the community? Yes ___ No ___

Are they familiar with the community? Yes ___ No ___

Are they available in the community? Yes ___ No ___

Are staff members involved with other activities in the community, other than the program? Yes ___ No ___

Which ones?

What effect, is any, has the program had on the community itself, both as a whole and with regard to particular subgroups? (Explain)

Is the location of the program convenient for the population to be served?
Yes ___ No ___

What is the history of responsiveness of the local school district and business to minority community needs and concerns?

How much support does it have among minority and majority community members? (Explain)

How supportive is the community of the program?

Assessing Business Support

How aware is the business community of the need for bilingual education?

Of its merit?

How willing are local business/industries to cooperate with the program in developing training programs?

What efforts?

How extensive has business and labor support and participation been?

How effective has it been?

How significant is support from the business community to the program?

How much impact has the bilingual education program had on the business community?

What structural or situational factors inhibit a closer, more effective business involvement?

How well known is the program in the business community?

___Very ___Fair ___Not at all

What is the perception of it?

Copyright (c) 1982 by Lester S. Golub,
The Pennsylvania State University,
University Park, Pa. 16802